

Monday, April 20, 2017

Kathleen Wynne, Premier
Legislative Building
Queen's Park
Toronto ON M7A 1A1

The Honourable Glen Murray
Minister of the Environment and Climate Change
2nd Floor Macdonald Block, 900 Bay Street
Toronto, Ontario
M7A 1N3

Dear Premier Wynne and Minister Murray,

We are asking that you require that the one-stop Scarborough Subway Extension (SSE) project be evaluated in comparison with the five-stop Scarborough RT and with the seven-stop LRT that was originally planned to replace the Scarborough RT.

As you are aware, the Environmental Assessment for the SSE is scheduled to commence shortly. Ontario's Transit Project Assessment Process provides for the Premier and the Minister to take action if there is "potential for a negative impact on a matter of provincial importance that relates to the natural environment." Accordingly, we believe:

- the SSE has the potential to exacerbate, rather than reduce, Ontario's greenhouse gas emissions
- that building the seven-stop LRT instead, would reduce Ontario's greenhouse gas emissions arising from transportation.

Ontario faces a stiff challenge in achieving its climate change targets. The 2016 Annual GHG Progress Report of the Environmental Commissioner of Ontario warns that Ontario's Climate Change Action Plan is unlikely to achieve the province's 2020 target for reducing greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions. It cautions that "transportation is Ontario's highest and fastest growing source of GHGs, "having increased over 27 per cent since 1990" and concludes that "reducing transportation emissions, must, therefore, be Ontario's highest climate change priority."

There are numerous grounds for concern about the potential for negative environmental and social impact of the SSE:

- **Design, construction and operation of the proposed 1-stop subway will not help reduce GHG emissions in a timely fashion.** A recent [study](#): The net

greenhouse gas impact of the Sheppard Subway Line by University of Toronto researchers measured the emissions generated by using large amounts of concrete and metal rebar as well as energy in subway construction and found it will take anywhere from 18 to 33 years for the line to offset its emissions. The study's recommendations include laying line above ground when possible, so as to reduce the polluting inputs. Similarly, the SSE is expected to take an enormous amount of concrete and other materials, because of the complexity and depth of its design and will run under capacity for decades. In contrast, constructing and operating a seven-stop LRT, built mostly above ground, would generate significantly fewer emissions during construction and attract more riders therefore offsetting its emissions much sooner than the SSE.

- **Costs of the SSE have increased to such an extent there is no money left for other priority transit lines for Scarborough.** At just the five percent design stage the SSE has consumed almost the entire envelope of money that the three levels of government had earmarked for higher order transit for Scarborough, which has left the 18-stop Eglinton East LRT unfunded. With so many unfunded transit projects in Toronto and elsewhere in Ontario, there is no guarantee that if the SSE is built that any other rapid transit project will appear any time soon in Scarborough. If the seven-stop LRT were to be built, there would be money left in the envelope to build the Eglinton East LRT. This would create a genuine network, linking a large part of Scarborough with rapid transit, further reducing the need for car travel and therefore, reducing emissions.
- **Unnecessary delay in providing rapid transit alternatives to personal auto travel.** Construction of the SSE is not expected to start until 2020 and won't be running until 2026 at the earliest, whereas the seven-stop LRT would only take four to five years to build.
- **LRT would carry more riders at peak times, 8,000 persons/hour, compared to just 7,300 persons/hour for the SSE.** Also, the latest city [report](#) shows an almost 50% drop (from 4,500 down to 2,300) in the SSE's ability to attract new riders.
- **With its above-ground design, the LRT option would encourage more dense development along its stops, more jobs and greater walkability.** It would maintain current RT station locations, as well as adding two new ones, which allow greater interface with the existing transit network and thus, more opportunities for people to use transit instead of their cars. But the SSE, with just one stop, will eliminate stations that are currently used by more than 12,000

riders per day and reduce connections with other transit.

So, Premier Wynne and Minister Murray, there is a lot riding on the decision of which option should be built in Scarborough. At the very least, there should be a careful comparative evaluation of the three options. Everyone in Ontario needs to know that scarce public funds are being used to maximize social, economic and environmental benefits.

Yours sincerely,

Scarborough Transit Action
TTCriders
1LoveMalvern Transportation
Working Group
Birchmount Bluffs Neighbourhood
Centre
Climate Fast
CodeRedTO
Council of Canadians (Toronto
chapter)
CUPW Local 602
De La Salle College "Oaklands"
Graduate Students' Association at
Scarborough, University of
Toronto Scarborough
Greenspiration
Matrix Management Corp.
Reena Foundation
Scarborough Civic Action Network
Scarborough Residents Unite
Neighbourhood Association
Scarborough Transit Action
Socialist Project
The Caring Alliance
The Council of Canadians
Toronto Environmental Alliance
Transport Action Canada
University of Toronto Graduate
Students Union
Cheri DiNovo, Urban Transit Critic
NDP
A H Harry Oussoren

A. Wilmot
Aakash Harpalani
Abbie Allan
Afifa Darabuddin
Akhter Ahmed
Alan Trufal
Alan Barthel
Alan Demb
Albert Truong
Alex Adams
Alex Cheesman
Alex Forgay
Ali Toufighi
Alice Schuda
Alicia Leyva
Alisa Gayle
Alisa Weyman
Alison Read
Alison Smiley
Alison Stirling
Allan McCartney
Allen Gunderson
Amanda Bhaggu
Amanda Clarke
Amanda Montgomery
Amber Scoyne
Amir Fleischmann
Andrea Calver
Andrea Diaz-Varela
Andrea Holtslander
Andrea Muehlebach

Andrea Vaalentini
Andrew Paton
Angela Del Buono
Anna Bourque
Anna Kim
Anna Luengo
Anna Willats
Anne Martin
Aram Melikian
Arlene Rogers
Arun Mukherjee
Asher Ettinger
Barbara Houston
Barbara Phillips
Barbara Phillips
Barbara Willitts
Barry Lipton
Becky Lee
Bee Lee Soh
Benjamin Bradley
Beryl Pilkington
Betty Kaser
Bill Bigelow
Bill Kime
Bill McGowan
Bill Worrell
Black Richards
Bonnie Boyd
Bonnie Briggs
Brad Young
Brian C.
Brian Malcolm
Mike Mattos
Brigitte Kitchen
Bruce A. Weber
Bruce Bryden
Bruce Eves
Bruce Galloway
Brydon Gombay
Bryson Winchester
Cameron MacLeod

Carol Kleinfeldt
Carol Krismer
Carol Schwartz
Carolanne MacLean
Carolyn Naftel
Catherine Molyneux
Cathy Line
Chad Morton
Charles Ritchie
Cheryl Gaster
Cheryl Litwack
Chris Gapski
Chris Harding
Christine Huddleston
Cindy Evans
Claude Bergeron
Clay Mcfayden
Clive Lawry
Clive Richards
Colette Snyder
Colman Hogan
Connie Tasse
Constance Dilley
Consuelo Castillo
Corey Broster
Cornelia Bryant
Cynthia Loch-Drake
Cynthia Wright
D Braithwaite
D C Appleyard
D. Theodore Walker
Dan Sommer
Dan Young
Daniel Murphy
Darren Puscas
Daryl Mahabir
David Black
David DePoe
David Fiske
David Klausner
David Kreindler

David Lidov
David Meyers
David Olson
David Pinto
David Simmons
Dean Middleton
Deb Gilchrist
Della Golland
Denise Martins
Denise Murphy
Dennis Findlay
Dennis Morrison
Desmond Brett
Diane Allen
Diane Gordon
Diane Shears
Dominique Russell
Don Ferguson
Donald MacIvor
Donald Peter St Amand
Donna Lang
Doris Bradley
Dorothy Holmes
Douglas Catty
Douglas Dees
Douglas Williams
Douglas Yardley
Ed Scherer
Eileen Thomas
Elaine Gort
Eleanor McKnight
Elena Basile
Elissa Green
Elizabeth Adams
Elizabeth Brownlie
Elizabeth Burrows
Elizabeth Gilarowski
Elizabeth Glor-Bell
Elizabeth Littlejohn
Ellen D'Heureux
Emily Paradis

Emma Dickson
Enrique Robert
Eric Mills
Eric Tucker
Erika Wybourn
Espie Kremetsova
Evelyn Steinberg
Ezra de Leon
Felicia Samuel
Florence Foerster
Frances Money
Frank Iacobucci
Frank McIntyre
Frank Nacsa
Frank O'Hara
Franziska Nonnenmann
Frieda Forman
Gail Funston
Gail Posen
Gay Couillard-Horrigan
Geoff Mosher
Geoffrey Allen
George X Tomaszewski
Gerald Lambers
Gerry Flynn
Giovanni Perna
Gita
Glen Moore
Glen Richards
Gordon Doctorow
Gordon Yarley
Gray Taylor
Gregg Hill
Guillermo Verdecchia
Gurbeen
Gyuszi S. Berki
Harold R. McMann
Harold Smith
Harriet Friedmann
Harry Smaller
Heather O'Neil

Henry Zongaro
Herminia Manuel
Holly Kirkconnell
howard lem
Hugh Pattison
Iain Campbell
Ian Roberts
Inge fowlie
Irene Roth
Izqabella Isakovich
J. E. Seth
J. Lawrence
J. Scott
Jacinta McDonnell
Jack Lee
Jacqueline Robinson
Jade Armstrong
James Bailey
James Scarrow
James Turk
Jane Bowman
Jane Rotering
Janet Bradley
Janet Maher
Jasmin Earle
Jason Brenner
Jason Milligan
Jason Witalis
Jeff Denton
Jeff Slater
Jeffrey Stone
Jen Liu
Jennifer Robinson
Jessica Mustachi
Jill McNall
Jim Bridle
Jim Christiansen
Jim Pickett
Jim Prince
Jean Warren
Joan Sutcliffe

Joanne Green
Johann Junginger
Johanna Faulk
John Argue
John Cummings
John Deacon
John Deviney
John deWit
John Dybczak
John Grant
John Huot
John Liss
John Muller
John Rae
John Russell
John Sharkey
Joseph Fernando
Joy Edwards
Julia McCrea
Julian Field
Julie McCarroll
Julie McNeill
June Blurton
June Gurvich
Juri Saulgriezis
Justin Lin
K Hayward
Karen Kenn
Karin Meinzer
Kasaun Bekele
Katarzyna
Kate Chung
Katherine Novak
Katherine-Anne Skinner
kathlene willing
Kelly Stinson
Ken Cory
Ken Macdonald
Ken Miller
Kerry Markle
Kevin Sanders

Kim Fraser
Kim Jarvi
Kirk Brown
Kit Wallace
Koa Thornhill
Kristian Truelsen
Kristin Cavoukian
Kristin Knowles
Kwesi Johnson
L cooper
L.Y. McIntyre
Lannie
Larry French
Larry m Roy
Larry McPhail
Lauren Morris
Lawrence Green
Leah Beck
Leila Sarangi
Leon Marr
Leslie Chin
Leslie Cleary
Leslie Dolman
Liisa L. North
Lillian Mendelsohn
Linda Beatty
Linda McCarthy
Lisa Garnet
Lisa Kowalchuk
Liz Janzen
Lois Schklar
Lorraine Purdon
Lu Nunnari
Luciano Iogna
Lucy Drumonde
Lyba Spring
Lyndel Hill
Lynn
Maggie Nebout
Maggie Robertson
Malcolm McKeil

Marc Angers
Marc Charbonneau
Marcello Mancuso
Margaret
Margaret Ferizis
Margaret Needham
Margie Sumadh
Margot Fish
Maria Antonieta Smith
Mariana Valverde
Marie Sydney
Marika Kemeny
Marilyn Belec Bittman
Mark Brill
Mark Ellis
Marlene Bourdon-King
Martin E. Gerwin
Martin Mostert
Mary Anne Fenton
Mary Boyce
Mary Lou Jorgensen-Bacher
Mary Lou Walker
Mary McGee
Mary Rose Cowan
Matthew A
Matthew Adams
Matthew Gallant
Matthew Kellway
Maureen Hynes
Maureen Kapral
Maxine Crook
Melanie Marsden
Melanie Warren
Melissa Goldstein
Michael Bednarski
Michael Blair
Michael Holloway
Michael Wirth
Michal Kapral
Michelle Langlois
Mike Antoniadis

Mike Kirkby
mike Sanderson
Moya Beall
MPP Cheri DiNovo
Murray Lumley
Myra Schiff
Nancy O'Connor
Neeraj Makim
Nell Van Meter
Neville Austin
Nick Marchese
Nicole W
Nirmalan Vijeyakumar
Odelle Agustin
Oksana Kuryliw
Patricia Hayward
Patricia Jones
patricia reid
Patrick McCartney
Paul Antze
Paul Bocking
Paul Clifford
Paul Gardner
Paul Mero
Paul Overy
Paul Rook
Paul Unterman
Pauline Thompson
Penina Coopersmith
Peter Fitting
Peter Gorman
Peter Harrison
Peter Money
Peter Park
Peter Shepherd
Peter Trainor
Peter Wantuch
Peter Wantuch
Peter Wilkins
Peter Ykelenstam
Philippa Baxter

Phyllis Brown
Phyllis Creighton
Pia Berger
Pleasance Crawford
Quenton Tutton
Rachelle Chevalier
ralph roberts
Ralph Carl Wushke
Rami Schandall
Randy Robinson
Raphael Dumas
Ray Chow
Ray Powers
Raymond Shen
Rebecca Murphy
Régine Bohar
Reiner Paessler
Rianna Thompson-Paessler
Richard Hayward
Richard Leitch
Richard Pathak
Richard Underhill
Rick Battams
Rishi Lukka
Robert A Wiseman
Robert Bernecky
Robert Chipman
Robert Haskett
Robert Heard
Robert Hickey
Robert Kemeny
Robert Pritchard
Robert Spencer
Rod Hunt
Roman Mychajlowycz
Ron Thompson
Ronald Kuipers
Rosemary Boissonneau
Rosemary Donegan
Rosemary Heather
Roslyn Rus

Ruth Grogan
Ruth Miller
Ruth Perkins
Ruth Schweitzer
Saeed Mohamed
Sajid Sajidi
Sam Bootsma
Sandra Glasbeek
Sandra Marcok
Sandra Peltier
Sarene Jamaluddin
Scott Moore
Shaine Macleod
Sharon Anderson
Sharon Goodier
Sharon Lovett
Shelly Romalis
Shirley Bush
Simon Threlkeld
Simon Tuplin
Simone Castaneda
Smadar Carmon
Sondra Bolton
Sonia Kurmey
Spencer Whyne
Stef Caron
Stefan Kipfer
Steffanie Adams
Stephanie Heidenreich
Stephen Douglas
Stephen Lintott
stephen walsh
Steve Chalastra
Steve Hellman
Steve Meikle
Steve Murphy
Steven Diener
Sudershan Singh
Sue Cumming
Sufiya Mary Reid
Suhail Barot

Susan Anderson
Susan Armstrong
susan bender
Susan Grabek
Susan Hudson
Susan Kasurak
Susan O'Connor
Susan Smith
Suzanne Johnson
Sylvia Pellman
Tai Pang Lui
Tammy Simpson
Ted Parkinson
ted roberts
Teresa Northcote
Terry O'Connor
Thomas Cohen
Thomas Evers
Tim den Broeder
Tim Hughes
Tim McCaskell
Tish Carnat
Tom Cullen
Tom McLaughlin
Tom McLaughlin
Tony Burns
Trevor Moo
Urszula Starzec
Valerie Hyman
Valerie Sylvester
Vanessa Syms
Vera Szoke
Vicki Kelman
Viktoria Robeznieks
Virginia Edman
Vittoria Di Santo
Wayne Watson
Wendy King
Will Taylor
William Dart
William Pyke

Xiaochun Jing

Yi Lin
Zeesy Power